



You couldn't pick a better place.

PLANNING BOARD
Monday, April 20, 2020
APPROVED MINUTES

OPENING: The meeting was called to order by Chairman John Osorio at 7:48 PM.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Led by John Osorio.

OPMA STATEMENT: Read by John Osorio in compliance with the Sunshine Law and per the New Jersey Department of Community Affairs' (NJDCA) Guidance for Remote Public Meetings in New Jersey (N.J.S.A. 10:4-9.1 (P.L. 2020, c.11)).

ROLL CALL

- **Members in attendance:** Ann Madden Tufano; Steve Musilli; Michele Golkow; John Osorio; Sheila Griffith; William Carter; Marlyn Kalitan; Sam Kates; and Alise Panitch.
- **Professionals in attendance:** Cosmas Diamantis, Esq., Secretary; Natalie Shafiroff, PP, AICP, Alternate Secretary; Jacob Richman, PP, AICP, Alternate Secretary; James Burns, Esq., Solicitor; and Stacey Arcari, PE, PP, CME, PTOE, Planning Board Engineer.

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

Appointment of Planning Board Engineer. John Osorio nominated Environmental Resolutions, Inc. (ERI) as the Planning Board Engineer for 2020. The motion was seconded by Ann Madden Tufano. The motion passes unanimously.

Appointment of Traffic Consultant. John Osorio nominated Environmental Resolutions, Inc. (ERI) as the Traffic Consultant for 2020. The motion was seconded by Michele Golkow. The motion passes unanimously.

Adoption Meeting Minutes from March 5, 2020. John Osorio made a motion, which was seconded by Sam Kates, to adopt the Meeting Minutes from March 5, 2020. Affirmative votes by Tufano, Musilli, Osorio, Carter, Kalitan, and Kates. Minutes are approved.

Agenda Item 1 & 2:

8752.005 (Phase 3B2)

Block(s) 55.01 Lot(s) 3

Zone: Regional Business (B4) Zone

Commerce Center at Cherry Hill, LLC

650-850 Garden Park Boulevard

Cherry Hill, NJ

Relief Requested: An amended preliminary and final major site plan with bulk (C) variances, including sign variances, to permit an additional 16,992 SF of retail and various site improvements in addition to the previously approved components as follows: a 154,109 SF retail store (Costco Wholesale) (clarified to actually be 155,1466 SF inclusive of the exterior wall space); a 16,008 SF pad site building; a conditionally permitted accessory gasoline service station (six (6) stacking lanes, four (4) bypass lanes, nine (9) multi-product gasoline dispensers, and 110 SF attendant's kiosk); and a 4,501 SF of retail store (liquor sales) attached to the CostCo, for Phase 3B at Garden State Park. This includes the reconfiguration of the previously approved 16,008 SF pad site building into a 29,700 SF building for two (2) retail tenants (Duluth Trading Company in the 10,000 SF space and an unknown retailer in the 19,700 SF space) as well as an additional 3,300 SF pad site (unknown retailer).

Continued from the Tuesday, January 21, 2020 Planning Board Meeting

8752.005 (Phase 3B2)

Block(s) 55.01 Lot(s) 3

Zone: Regional Business (B4) Zone

Commerce Center at Cherry Hill, LLC

650-850 Garden Park Boulevard

Cherry Hill, NJ

Relief Requested: An amended General Development Plan (GDP) to permit an additional 16,992 SF of retail and various site improvements in addition to the previously approved components as follows: a 154,109 SF retail store (Costco Wholesale) (clarified to actually be 155,1466 SF inclusive of the exterior wall space); a 16,008 SF pad site building; a conditionally permitted accessory gasoline service station (six (6) stacking lanes, four (4) bypass lanes, nine (9) multi-product gasoline dispensers, and 110 SF attendant's kiosk); and a 4,501 SF of retail store (liquor sales) attached to the CostCo, for Phase 3B at Garden State Park. This includes the reconfiguration of the previously approved 16,008 SF pad site building into a 29,700 SF building for two (2) retail tenants (Duluth Trading Company in the 10,000 SF space and an unknown retailer in the 19,700 SF space) as well as an additional 3,300 SF pad site (unknown retailer).

Continued from the Tuesday, January 21, 2020 Planning Board Meeting

Applicant's Representatives: Doug Wolfson, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney; John Taikina, PP, AICP – Edgewood Properties/Director of Real Estate Development for Edgewood Properties; Doug Brookbank, AIA, NCARB and Mike Gokberk, AIA – Applicant's Professional Architects; Karl Pehnke, PE, PTOE – Applicant's Professional Traffic Engineer; and Christine Cofone, PP, AICP – Applicant's Professional Planner.

Exhibits Submitted:

Previously Submitted Exhibits: A-1: Site Plan dated 8/17/17; A-2: Site Plan revised 12/30/19; A-3: Old Landscaping Plan approval; A-4: Proposed Landscaping Plan; A-5: Prior Approved Costco signage; A-6: Proposed Costco signage; A-7: Material Board; A-8: Prior Entry Door Sign; A-9: Proposed Entry Door Sign; A-10: Prior East Elevation Signage; A-11: Proposed East Elevation Signage; A-12: Prior Approved Floor Plan; A-13: Proposed Floor Plan; A-14: Prior Elevation Details; A-15: Proposed Elevation Details; and A-16: Proposed Sign Variance Plan.

Newly Submitted Exhibits: A-420-1: CostCo Sign Plan; A-420-2: Costco Signage Elevation; A-420-3: Building Elevations 1; A-420-4: Building Elevations 2; A-420-5: Sign Variance Plan; A-420-6: Site Layout Plan; A-420-7: Striping Plan; A-420-8: Approved Landscaping Plan from 2017; A-420-9: Landscaping Plan from January 2020; A-420-10: Proposed Landscaping Plan; A-420-11: Landscaping Details; A-420-12: Site Plan from August 2017; A-420-13: CostCo Architecture Plan from 2017; and A-420-14: CostCo Elevations showing 5 Bay Door Tire Center.

Mr. Wolfson reintroduced the application which was continued from the January 21, 2020 Planning Board Meeting. Mr. Wolfson affirmed that the applicant is requesting Amended General Development Plan (GDP) and Amended Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with Bulk (C) Variances. Mr. Wolfson stated that since the January meeting, the applicant has worked on revising the plans to address the Planning Board professional's and Planning Board member's comments as it relates to signage, landscaping, and the site layout.

Mr. Taikina presented exhibit A-420-12 and gave a brief overview of the previously approved site plan for the site from back in 2017 which at the time did not have any variance requests. This approved the Costco and Gas Station and a 16,000 SF+ retail pad site. This plan left some open spaces on the site for future development. Also, exhibit A-420-12 shows the previously approved landscaping plan which shows the aforementioned open space areas being landscaped. In exhibit A-420-12, Mr. Taikina showcased the previously approved architectural plan for the Costco and Gas Station and noted that these structures are presently under construction. Per exhibit A-420-14, Mr. Taikina showed the previously approved building elevations for CostCo inclusive of the proposed signage.

Mr. Brookbank explained that the one architectural change to the Costco building is the addition of a fifth bay door to the east elevation, up from the initial proposed four (4) bay doors. Mr. Brookbank stated the applicant is still proposing a sign over the angled main entry doorway to Costco measuring 124 SF. Per exhibit A-420-1, Mr. Brookbank explained that their initial façade sign package to remove the Costco identification sign from the south elevation and reduce the size of the east elevation Costco sign down to 280 SF. Mr. Brookbank provided testimony that even though the sign is greater than the 150 SF permitted, the sign is more appropriately sized based upon the size of the elevation and the distance from the elevation to the roadway. Mr. Brookbank presented exhibit A-420-2 to show all of the Costco façade signs plus the Liquor Sales and Tire Center signs. Mr. Brookbank stated that even though there are variances involved for the number of signs, the total sign area per elevation stays under 15% of the overall façade area. Mr. Brookbank also stated the sign package is consistent in size in relationship to other uses at the Garden State Park. Mr. Brookbank stated that the size of the loading areas and number of bay doors is more in line with the operations for Costco.

Mr. Brookbank added that the parking count at the site is at 690 and a typical Costco may have around 750 parking spaces but still meets the Zoning Ordinance requirements. Mr. Brookbank, in response to some Board member's comments, believes that while the parking count is lower than the normal parking count numbers, that the site will still find a way to work. Mr. Taikina stated that the site was designed to maximize parking for peak times but not have too excessive of impervious coverage; however, Mr. Taikina stated that in addition to the 690 parking spaces designated for Costco, the site has an additional 153 parking spaces for the other retail sites.

Mr. Taikina submitted exhibit A-420-3 to show the main pad site measure 29,700 SF for two (2) retail tenants. One tenant will be Duluth Trading Company with the other to be announced at a later date; however, it is to be a design store. Mr. Taikina went through the proposed signage for Duluth Trading Company and the variances requested related to location and number of signs as well as proposed sign areas for the as of yet announced second retail space in the building. Mr. Taikina also detailed the architecture/design of the retail pad site building. Mr. Taikina clarified that the design store Architecturals shows some design elements in the windows; however, he is not presently asking for relief from the Board for those elements. Mr. Taikina stated that the reason the pad site buildings have signs on all four sides is because the buildings were designed to accentuate the aesthetic of all sides of the building; however, Mr. Kates raised concerns about the necessity of the signs facing the rear (west) of the site. Ms. Shafiroff noted that the Board's Professional Planner,

Pennoni, indicated that due to the circuitous nature of the site, signs on all four (4) sides are appropriate. Ms. Kalitan suggested utilizing smaller signs on the rear of the site as a mitigating factor. Mr. Gokberk provided some clarification on the size of the facades for the pad site building. Following discussion, the Planning Board seemed in favor of signs on the rear (west) elevation but that the size of those signs shall be delegated to the Department of Community Development but that said signs would be less than 150 SF.

Mr. Taikina submitted exhibit A-420-4 to show the smaller of the pad site buildings (dubbed the "jewel box") which is proposed to accommodate two (2) retail tenants. Mr. Taikina stated that each tenant proposes (3) signs for each space and gave an overview of the architectural design of the structure. Variances for the signs would be needed related to the number and location of the signs but not for the size as sizing will be conforming to the Zoning Ordinance. Mr. Taikina presented exhibit A-420-6 to show how the pad sites are situated on the overall site and surrounding roadways. Ms. Kalitan stated she does not believe this particular building needs signs on all sides like the larger of the pad site buildings a discussion ensued regarding the previous architecture showing one tenant and now it shows two tenants and how that affects the number of signs on the façade and the freestanding multi-tenant sign as well as appropriately sizing the signs. It was recommended that the applicant work with the Department of Community Development on appropriate sizing ratios.

Mr. Taikina referred to A-420-6 to indicate the variances associated with the site layout which refer to parking setbacks from property lines and Right-Of-Ways (ROWs) as well as a slightly reduced landscaping buffer to Garden Park Boulevard. Mr. Taikina detailed the roadway/stripping improvements, per exhibit A-420-7, as it relates to turning movements into the site and their corresponding driveways. Mr. Taikina noted that Saddleback Lane (Road 'A') is not becoming an at-grade rail crossing but it now only really acting as a driveway to the site since the at-grade railing crossing is not proceeding. A discussion ensued about how to designate the roadway in terms of ownership and the viability of vacating the roadway; however, Mr. Taikina believes it should remain a roadway under the ownership of the master association and maintained entirely by the applicant.

Mr. Taikina presented exhibit A-420-10 to show the proposed landscaping changes (from the 2017 approved plan to the proposed January 2020 plan) and showed how the landscaping that was reduced/removed from the south of the site is being relocated to the north and west of the site where additional space has become available due to new designation of Saddleback Lane. Mr. Taikina also discussed pulling some landscaping from the design and sending it to the adjacent "Civic Lots" adjacent to Saddleback Lane in order to enhance those lots and provide a better amenity to the community. Mr. Taikina stated that the applicant is willing to work with the Planning Board professionals to finalize how that would all look from a design perspective. Mr. Taikina added that he is not inclined to open up a pathway/pedestrian only access to Third Avenue but is open to comments and solutions for that area. Mr. Taikina added that they will comply with Community Development comments pertaining to providing a sidewalk and corresponding crosswalk in from the Saddleback Lane accessway to the Costco at the building's northeast corner. They will also include a solid 8' tall fence along the western boundary of the site adjacent to the railroad ROW. Mr. Taikina went through the Planning Board professionals review escrow comments and also noted the applicant's Amended GDP request does not trigger any new variances.

Mr. Pehnke did an analysis (Traffic Impact Study) of the traffic and circulation in and around the site. After noting the history of the traffic analyses and improvements already made and/or under construction, Mr. Pehnke stated that the proposed plan does not add a significant amount of new traffic over the previously approved plan for the site. Mr. Pehnke noted that site circulation is only moderately changed but ultimately believes it is an improvement over the previous iteration of the plan. As it relates to parking, Mr. Pehnke believes the available parking spaces for Costco is sufficient and balances with overall proposed lot coverage. Mr. Pehnke address wayfinding and identification signage and how they are important and appropriate in promoting safe site circulation. Mr. Pehnke added that he does not expect to see much traffic along Saddleback Lane as it is more of a back entrance to the site which also means limited turning movements occurring at that intersection.

A recess was announced by Chairman Osorio at 10:05pm and the meeting resumed at 10:10pm.

Ms. Cofone went through the requested variances and first touched upon the proposed signs and why she finds them appropriate based upon their scale, size, and location as well as it how the proposed signs meet the Sign Ordinance as it relates to achieving its intent/purposes. As such, Ms. Cofone believes the benefits outweigh any detriments. As it relates to the site planning variances associated with impervious coverage, parking setbacks, and landscaping buffer setback, Ms. Cofone provided the positive and negative criteria for the requested variances and believes many of the variance requests are de minimus and that the requests help advance the intent and purpose of the Master Plan and Zoning Ordinance (B4 zoning district). A discussion ensued about the degree of helpfulness a fourth sign as opposed to three signs for a tenant really makes.

Ms. Arcari and Ms. Shafiroff offered brief comments on their respective letters. Mr. Taikina stated that he does not object to the straightening out of the lot lines of the "Civic Lots" and Saddleback Lane so it functions in the most efficient manner possible provided all of the legal aspects can be worked out.

Public Discussion: None.

Motion GDP: Following the reiteration of the conditions by Solicitor Burns, William Carter made a motion, which was seconded by Sam Kates, to approve the requested Amended General Development Plan (GDP). Affirmative votes by Tufano, Musilli, Golkow, Osorio, Griffith, Carter, Kalitan, and Kates. The motion is approved.

Motion Site Plan: Following the reiteration of the conditions by Solicitor Burns, John Osorio made a motion, which was seconded by Michele Golkow, to approve the Amended Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with Bulk (C) Variances. Affirmative votes by Tufano, Musilli, Golkow, Osorio, Griffith, Carter, Kalitan, and Kates. The application is approved.

Following the applications, Mr. Osorio announced that the applications for Charles W. Foulke, Jr. (#18-P-0020), New Jersey Restaurants, LLC (#19-P-0022), and Camden County College (#19-P-0047) have been postponed and new public notice will be provided.

Resolutions:

19-P-0020

Block(s) 55.01 Lot(s) 1
Zone: Regional Business (B4)

GS Park Racing, LP

2200 Route 70 West
Cherry Hill, NJ

Relief Requested: A preliminary and final major site plan to develop a 30,000 SF (approximate) off-tracking wagering facility and preservation of the existing Garden State Park gatehouse with various site improvements.

Motion to Ratify: Following the review of the resolution, John Osorio made a motion which was seconded by Sam Kates, to memorialize the resolution. Affirmative votes by Tufano, Osorio, Kalitan, Kates and Panitch. The resolution is memorialized.

18-P-0015

Block(s) 343.03 Lot(s) 7
Zone: Residential (R2)

John Cahill

1108 Warren Avenue
Cherry Hill, NJ

Relief Requested: A minor subdivision to subdivide one (1) residential lot to create two (2) residential lots

Motion to Ratify: Following the review of the resolution, John Osorio made a motion which was seconded by Ann Madden Tufano, to memorialize the resolution. Affirmative votes by Tufano, Musilli, Osorio, Griffith, Carter, Kalitan, and Kates. The resolution is memorialized.

Meeting Adjourned: at 11:07 PM.

ADOPTED: 5/4/20



JOHN OSORIO, CHAIRMAN

ATTEST:



COSMAS DIAMANTIS, ESQ.
PLANNING BOARD SECRETARY